

To the kind attention of:

**Mr Siim KALLAS** [CAB-KALLAS-WEB-FEEDBACK@ec.europa.eu](mailto:CAB-KALLAS-WEB-FEEDBACK@ec.europa.eu)

Vice President of the European Commission

European Commission  
200 Rue de la Loi  
Berlaymont  
B-1049 BRUSSELS

and, c.c. :

**Mrs Désirée OEN** [desiree.oen@ec.europa.eu](mailto:desiree.oen@ec.europa.eu)

Coordination of TEN-T projects  
TEN-T Agency  
Relations with European Parliament

**Mrs Helen KEARNS** [helen.kearns@ec.europa.eu](mailto:helen.kearns@ec.europa.eu)

Spokesperson

**Mr Laurens Jan Brinkhorst** [move-coord-brinkhorst@ec.europa.eu](mailto:move-coord-brinkhorst@ec.europa.eu)

Coordinator of the TEN-T Priority Project n. 6

Railway axis Lyon-Trieste-Divaca/Koper-Divaca-Ljubljana-Budapest- Ukrainian border

**Mr Günther Ettl**

Assistant to Mr L.J. Brinkhorst – [guenther.ettl@ec.europa.eu](mailto:guenther.ettl@ec.europa.eu)

from No TAV Valleys, July 11<sup>th</sup>, 2011

subject: **New Lyon-Turin railway line (TEN-T Priority Project No 6)**

---

Dear European Commission Vice President Siim Kallas,

We are writing on behalf of the TAV Movement that, while supporting the rail as a historical development tool and a social cohesion maker, has anyway been opposing for 22 years the high-speed railway Lyon-Turin (TEN-T Priority Project n. 6) as this project is useless, senseless and devastating.

The No TAV Movement has been an interlocutor of the European Union's for a long time and has been in contact with:

- the European Parliament through the Committee on Petitions,
- the European Commission thanks to a collaboration settled in September 2010 in order to have access to all the documents arranged by the Regulation (EC) No 1049/2001 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2001 regarding public access to European Parliament, Council and Commission documents and by the Aarhus' Convention of June 25, 1998 (2003/4/CE Directive),
- OLAF, through some reports about some suspected frauds linked to the Priority Project n° 6 even in this first phase (!).

So we wish to carry on these relations and on this point we ask you to provide us with any useful document about the many delays the European Commission - according to some authoritative Italian representatives (among whom Mr Mario Virano stands out) - has granted Italy.

We call your attention to the fact that, because of these delays, Italy first militarized the Susa Valley and then on June 27<sup>th</sup>, at daybreak, the police evacuated the peaceful settlements set by the local people, using an unexpected, violent military action, using a huge amount (over 2000 grenades) of CS tear gas that have been forbidden by the UN as they are considered CHEMICAL WEAPONS.

**All that in order to show the European Commission that the elusive deadline of June 30<sup>th</sup>, known and legitimated by you, Mr Kallas, had been met.**

You, Mr Kallas, were personally warned on May 24<sup>th</sup> 2011 through a written question about the danger that a possible militarization of the Susa Valley would mean for the public order of the area. That written question had been signed by a lot of members of the European Parliament.

Considering that the deadline of June 30<sup>th</sup> 2011 is not mentioned on any website of the European Commission, it is clear that the deadline has been decided – with the help of the European Commission – by the Turin-Lyon new railway advocates as a European ultimatum on pain of financing loss.

You, Mr Kallas, instead of responsibly contacting the Italian and the French Ministers in order to shed light on the matter and to find an alternative solution, answered the interpellation of the members of the European Parliament avoiding to take your own independent position, declaring it was a domestic Italian problem and believing in Mr Virano's false information about the pacification of the area.

Your answer was given on June 29<sup>th</sup>, two days after the Italian Interior Minister, Mr Roberto Maroni, sparked off the police aggression.

By your belated answer you, Mr Kallas, legitimated the elusive deadline of June 30<sup>th</sup> and tried to decrease your own responsibility which now in fact looks much more increased.

On Sunday July 3<sup>rd</sup>, in Chiomonte, an impressive demonstration against the police evacuation of June 27<sup>th</sup> and the following militarization of the whole area, where very valuable vineyards are grown, gathered about 70.000 people.

During the march the police used an unprecedented violence, using a huge amount of CS tear gas - which was thrown in the middle of the unarmed crowd - for over six hours in order to send the demonstrators away. The demonstrators had met under the fence surrounding the building site and in front of the fortified road block along the Avanà Road and they could have done nothing against the military force and the actual defenses of the area (walls, barbed-wire fences, etc.). The casualties reported by the police were mainly caused by the incompetent public order management of the police headquarters, by the roughness of the ground and by the people's intoxication caused by the CS tear gas.

All that has actually caused a great damage to the credibility of the European Commission who has not been able to create the right condition for a dialogue, believing recklessly in what Mr Virano has been propagandizing.

The building site for the La Maddalena Gallery has not been installed yet as no European call for tenders has ever been announced, three petitions are still lying at the TAR (Regional Administrative Court) in Lazio (Italy) and 128 limitations of the CIPE (Inter Ministerial Committee for the Economic Planning) will have to be taken into consideration before the building site can be opened.

The works done by some building firms and shown to the media and to Europe are only about the enclosure of the police "fortress" and they have nothing to do with the contract for La Maddalena Gallery, for which no European financing is possible.

The only works done by some building firms, have simply built an enclosure made of concrete, iron and barbed wire in order to defend the "fortress" within an archeological area which is very far from the spot where the building site is supposed to be installed. An area which in the project was granted as completely free from any servitude or exploitation.

We also point out that the building firm has done nothing yet to mark the boundary of the actual building site (which is 500 metres away from the military bunker). This means anyone can enter the site which is not controlled by the police.

The Italian No TAV Movement has been opposing in a non-violent, democratic and popular way the construction of the new Lyon-Turin railway line for 22 years: this unanimous opposition, that includes citizens, local administrators, priests, scientists , etc. is growing constantly and this is stressed by the recent manifestations which are going to be repeated in the next months and years.

The future of TEN-T projects is certainly in your thoughts. You, Mr Kallas , have shown it in many of your interventions with innovative statements that suggested the possibility of a true change in transport infrastructures in the European Union.

On June 8<sup>th</sup>, 2010 in Zaragoza, on the occasion of the TEN-T Days, you said:

Where should we make crucial investments to facilitate better functioning of existing networks? It is clear that a big jump in infrastructure is not possible. Building new railways, roads, airports, and ports is enormous work and takes a long time and bigger resources. All smart transport systems can bring larger and faster benefits.

In our opinion this remark seems to stress your strong concern about the fact that the EU is not able to find innovative solutions to the European transport system also considering the scarcity of funds - initially planned in more than 900 billion euro - to be allocated to transport infrastructures by some EU Member States.

We believe that the **profound financial and economic crisis** under way in Europe requires a new common transport policy that is based on investment criteria evaluated by cost benefit analysis integrated by LCA (Life Cycle Assessment).

**Italy will never be able to meet even short-term commitments with France and the European Union for the realization of this work** as its financial resources are extremely limited, and others are the priorities of the Italian rail transport in short and medium term (local transport and North-South axis).

**Identifying advantages of alternative investment patterns** and matching of transport modalities with the local mobility needs is urgent. A call for a discussion of ideas and projects that are potentially alternative to the high-speed transport modality is urgently needed. In particular, what is important is the matching of the transport modalities designed and offered with the local mobility needs. An innovative design should take the maximum advantage of the existing transportation network and enhance its ability to meet the local needs without losing the connection with the international network. The concept itself of "high-speed" needs to be explored in relation to concepts of quality of life and social and environmental integrity.

On September 29<sup>th</sup>, 2010 the Committee on Petitions of the European Parliament has received several citizens in representation of the No TAV Movement and listened to their reasons (the petitions were accompanied by 32,000 signatures - filed in the European Parliament since 2003).

The President Mrs Erminia Mazzoni decided on the basis of insufficient arguments used during that meeting by the representative of the European Commission, that our petitions cannot be closed but instead require further study as follows:

**"Decision:** Consideration of the petition would remain open pending further information from the Commission, particularly on the functioning of the technical observatory and the involvement of the affected local authorities."

We sincerely appreciated the MEP Erminia Mazzoni's doubts about the *"lack of democracy"* in the dialogue between institutions and citizens on the Lyon - Turin new railway line.

We remind that EC did receive the 24 resolutions of opposition to the new railway approved by the Boards of 24 municipalities.

We remind you that the EC received 24 resolutions opposing the new railway which were passed by 24 local administrations.

We remind you that the financing of € 0.67 billion granted in December 2008 by the European Commission to Italy and France had been approved also on the basis of the false "Pra Catinat Agreement", of June 28, 2008 between the Observatory and the local administrations: this so called agreement is false because as a matter of fact it is just a document signed only by its editor who is at the same time the President of the Observatory.

We expect you take an initiative that could lead the European Union, Italy and France to cancel this useless and nonsense investment (TEN-T Priority Project No. 6 Lyon - Turin) which can only harm the environment, public health, budgets in Europe, in Italy and in France, as it is proved by numerous studies.

We thank you for your attention and look forward to your reply.

Yours sincerely,

*On behalf of the no TAV Movement:*

*Claudio Cancelli*

*Mario Cavargna*

*Claudio Giorno*

*Luca Giunti*

*Alberto Perino*

*Paolo Prieri*

*Doriana Tassotti*

---

## **Attachments:**

**24 May 2011**

### **Question for written answer to the Commission Rule 117**

Luigi de Magistris (ALDE) , Sonia Alfano (ALDE) , Catherine Grèze (Verts/ALE) , Eva Lichtenberger (Verts/ALE) , Paul Murphy (GUE/NGL) , Gianni Vattimo (ALDE) and Sabine Wils (GUE/NGL)

<http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?pubRef=-//EP//TEXT+WQ+E-2011-005080+0+DOC+XML+V0//EN>

**Subject: TEN T Priority Project No 6 Lyons — Turin: Alteration of the project and Italy's non-compliance with the conditions imposed by the European Commission for obtaining EU funding**

According to posts on the websites of the Italian Ministry of Infrastructure and the Piedmont Regional Government, and to reports in major newspapers (La Stampa, La Repubblica, Il Sole 24 Ore, etc.), a meeting of the Lyons-Turin Institutional Roundtable was held in Rome on 3 May 2011 in the presence of Minister Matteoli, the Deputy Secretary to the Premier's Office, Mr Letta, the Special Commissioner, Mr Virano, the President of the Italian delegation to the IGC, Mr Masera, the President of the Piedmont Regional Government, Mr Cota, the President of Turin Province, Mr Saitta, the Mayor of Turin, Mr Chiamparino, and a group of mayors from the Susa Valley.

At that meeting, the Italian Government was due to announce the decision to scale back the TEN T Priority Project No 6 by eliminating one of the twin tubes at the base tunnel and at the Orsiera tunnel owing to the Italian State's lack of funds; that part of the working procedure had already been rejected when Italy and France requested funding from the EU in 2007.

In clear contrast with the principles set out in the Aarhus Convention of 25 June 1998 (Directive 2003/4/EC), the mayors of 17 towns and the President of the Mountain Communities of the Susa and Sangone Valleys, who oppose the construction of the new rail line, were excluded from the

meeting, while two mayors from towns not geographically affected by the project, but politically close to the government, were invited.

Is the Commission aware of these facts?

Is the Commission aware that reformulating new preliminary projects will probably cause fresh delays in the timetable established during the October 2010 Mid-term Review and that, considering the wholesale permanent opposition to the project from the Valley's population and lack of agreement among the majority of municipalities in the territories concerned, opening the site for the geognostic tunnel at La Maddalena might only be possible by militarizing the entire area?

#### **EN E-005080/2011**

##### **Answer given by Mr Kallas on behalf of the Commission (29.6.2011)**

The Institutional Roundtable of 3 May 2011 in Rome, to which the Honourable Members refer, was an internal meeting held by the Italian Government on which the Commission cannot comment.

<http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getAllAnswers.do?reference=E-2011-005080&language=EN>

As regards the new railway link Lyon-Turin, the Commission has been noting with satisfaction the efforts undertaken by the Italian Government and its Commissioner Mario Virano over the past years in order to communicate the benefits of this major infrastructure project. In the light of the progress made in seeking support for the project from the local population the Commission welcomes the decision of the Italian authorities to start the works on the geognostic tunnel La Maddalena in the coming weeks.

The details of these works are an internal Italian matter on which the Commission does not wish to comment.

---



# NO TAV Movement

A guarantee for the future

[www.notav.info](http://www.notav.info) - [www.notav.eu](http://www.notav.eu) - [www.notav-valsangone.eu](http://www.notav-valsangone.eu)  
[www.notavtorino.org](http://www.notavtorino.org) - [www.ambientevalsusa.it](http://www.ambientevalsusa.it) - [www.lavallecheresiste.blogspot.com](http://www.lavallecheresiste.blogspot.com)

## Press release

from the Valley who resists and will never surrender, July 5<sup>th</sup> , 2011

### HUMAN COST OF THE DEFENSE OF THE PUBLIC ORDER IN THE SUSA VALLEY

#### **Casualties among the police who received medical attention or were even sent to hospital were 229**

The official data about the American Army in Afghanistan say that in the first 4 months in 2011 there were 1,178 wounded soldiers on an amount of 63,500 men: an average of 1.86%.

According to the information given by the Italian media, in the area called La Maddalena (Chiomonte), on a reported amount of 1920 policemen 229 of them got wounded during the public order operation performed on Monday, June 27<sup>th</sup> 2011 (25 casualties) , and on Sunday, July 3<sup>rd</sup> 2011( 204 casualties): an average of 11.93%.

US Army data source:

<http://icasualties.org/OEF/USCasualtiesByState.aspx>

<http://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/natsec/R40682.pdf>

*“neither here nor anywhere else”*



# NO TAV Movement

**A guarantee for the future**

[www.notav.info](http://www.notav.info) - [www.notav.eu](http://www.notav.eu) - [www.notav-valsangone.eu](http://www.notav-valsangone.eu)  
[www.notavtorino.org](http://www.notavtorino.org) - [www.ambientevalsusa.it](http://www.ambientevalsusa.it) - [www.lavallecheresiste.blogspot.com](http://www.lavallecheresiste.blogspot.com)

## Press release

from the Valley who resists and will never surrender, July 4<sup>th</sup> , 2011

### **THE MILITARY DEFENCE DEVICE OF THE “FORTRESS” AT LA MADDALENA WILL COST TWICE THE AMOUNT OF MONEY THE UE WILL GIVE FOR THE NEW TURIN-LYON RAILWAY**

**4.000 Soldiers in Afghanistan and 2.000 policemen in “Valsusastan”  
A reminder for the Italian citizens and for Italy, a Country in crisis**

The No TAV Movement points out that, while the digging of the La Maddalena Gallery will cost not less than 143 million for 56 working months, **the military device adopted to oppose the popular dissidence will cost 186 million a year, therefore in total 868 million Euros (6 times the value of the work).**

It's important to notice that the amount of the militarization will cost more than twice the value of the financing to lost fund that the European Union has promised Italy. It amounts in fact to 417,4 million Euros, or rather the 63% of the 662,6 million Euros which are expected for this Priority Project n. 6: the rest of the money will be given to France.

All the analyses have been done considering the industrial costs and the organization of the troops (officers, junior officers, privates) and the relative direct and indirect costs (salary, overtime hours, indemnity of mission, year-end bonus, severance pay, board and lodging ). The direct and indirect costs of vehicles and helicopters, the cost of tear gas and the general expenses of the commanding police officers, have not been considered.

At La Maddalena, according to the declarations furnished by the media, 1,920 men on 4 shifts were employed. The cost of every man was 265.06 Euros a day on the average. The annual cost of this device is therefore 185,754,048 Euros.

A similar evaluation was already made in 2010 during the drillings for the land surveys, it was published on the No TAV Movement websites and never denied.

When the 57 km tunnel site will be opened, the cost of the military defence of the building site, for the expected 15 working years could be, according to the present cost, 2,79 million Euros.

***“neither here nor anywhere else”***



# NO TAV Movement

A guarantee for the future

[www.notav.info](http://www.notav.info) - [www.notav.eu](http://www.notav.eu) - [www.notav-valsangone.eu](http://www.notav-valsangone.eu)  
[www.notavtorino.org](http://www.notavtorino.org) - [www.ambientevalsusa.it](http://www.ambientevalsusa.it) - [www.lavallecheresiste.blogspot.com](http://www.lavallecheresiste.blogspot.com)

## Press release

from the Valley who resists and will never surrender, July 1st, 2011

## June 30<sup>th</sup> 2011: another deadline expired

**A NO TAV TECHNICAL COMMITTEE HAS VERIFIED THAT THE BUILDING SITE OF LA MADDALENA GALLERY HAS NOT BEEN OPENED YET THE EUROPEAN UNION MUST NOW WITHDRAW THE FINANCING TO THE PRIORITY PROJECT TEN-T N. 6 LYON-TURIN**

**Italy should take advantage of this “unexpected” opportunity to use the thousands Euros saved from the building of the new freight and passengers rail link between Turin and Lyon in other works that might useful to all citizens**

---

On June 28<sup>th</sup> a No Tav Technical Committee, with the assistance of the French/Italian company and the building company, carried out an inspection at the La Maddalena area, which was occupied by the Police in the night between June 26<sup>th</sup> and June 27<sup>th</sup>. The Committee examined all the features of the works going on in the area thanks to the kind collaboration of LTF sas people in charge and of the manager of the Italian building firm who is actually working there.

So we can say that the ghost deadline of June 30<sup>th</sup>, 2011 that the European Commission is supposed to have established departing from what they had officially stated on their site, page 71<sup>L11</sup> of the Document “MidTerm Review TEN-T Multi-Annual Work Programme Project Portfolio (MAP Review)”, has not been met yet as no building site has ever been opened at La Maddalena.

**The works they have started** in the area that belongs to the Comunità Montana delle Valli di Susa e Sangone (Susa and Sangone Valleys Mountain Community), surrounding the Cantina Sociale (Social Wine Industry) and the old farm La Maddalena (now an Archeological Museum) **are not an “outpost” serving the future building site of the La Maddalena gallery but nothing else than a “simulacrum” of the La Maddalena building site to be shown to the European Commission and to the media, in order not to lose the European financing.**

The manager of the building firm told us that the enclosures can be removed in a half day's time whenever the Prefect orders them to do so.

It is absolutely impossible to find this project among all the ones that can be looked at by the local administrations and by the citizens and it can't be found in any alteration

to the plan (which anyway couldn't have been arranged as the project itself has not been started yet ).

Once again the No TAV Movement invites the European Commission to draw their conclusion about this last farce of the Italian Government, cancelling the Decision to finance the project C(2008)7733.

At the same time the No TAV Movement asks the Italian Government to take advantage of this "unexpected" opportunity to use the thousands Euros saved from the project of a new freight and passengers rail link between Turin and Lyon (an unnecessary and devastating work) in something that might be useful to the Italian citizens (such as the cancellation of the tax on Health Service).

**The No TAV Movement reminds that the other conditions (already expired on December 31, 2010) made by the European Commission in order to give Italy the financing are:**

- the endorsement of the preliminary project of the international section: right now the project is still lying at the special VIA Committee of the Ministry of the Environment. These documents are missing:
  - the opinion about the compatibility that must be released by a Decree of the Ministry of the Environment,
  - the CIPE resolution approving the project which must be released after the former opinion.
- the signature and the confirmation by the respective Parliaments about a new agreement between France and Italy with a new allocation of financing and costs and the establishment of the new Italian and French State company that will substitute LTF sas in the making of the project starting from the La Maddalena Gallery.

<sup>[1]</sup> [http://tentea.ec.europa.eu/download/map\\_review/tent\\_map\\_project\\_portfolio\\_smaller.pdf](http://tentea.ec.europa.eu/download/map_review/tent_map_project_portfolio_smaller.pdf)

***"neither here nor anywhere else"***



## New Lyon-Turin rail link – Franco-Italian common part of the international section (studies and works)

2007-EU-06010-P • Part of Priority Project 6

<b>Commission Decision:</b> C(2006)7733	
<b>Member States involved:</b> Italy, France	
<b>Implementation schedule:</b> Start date: January 2007 End date: December 2013 Estimated end year: 2015	
<b>Budget:</b>	
Total project cost:	€2,091,192,000
EU contribution:	€671,800,000
National budget:	€1,419,392,000
<b>Percentage of EU support:</b>	
Studies:	50%
Works:	27%



The new freight and passenger rail link between Lyon and Turin (Priority Project 6) will act as a key node between northern and southern Europe (London/Amsterdam/Paris-Milano) and west and east (Lisbon-Budapest). It will considerably shorten travel times for high speed passenger traffic and provide an environmentally friendly response to the steadily increasing demand for freight transport over the Alps.

This project concerns the common French-Italian part of the 80 km international section from Saint Jean de Maurienne to Sant'Antonino-Vaie in the Susa valley. The main lineside structures are the 57.1 km French-Italian "Base Tunnel" and the 11.4 km Orsiera Tunnel on the Italian side.

The project includes technical design studies, environmental studies, realisation of descending shafts and galleries, preparation of the construction sites and the first steps of construction phases.

### MAP Review

The Mid-Term evaluation concluded that despite the progress achieved so far, the future implementation of the project will be significantly delayed, because of cross-border coordination and technical issues. Furthermore, the decreased costs of the works entail a reduction to the TEN-T contribution of approximately €9.2 million. The completion of the project by the end of 2015 is more realistic, provided that the following conditions are met:

- the two Member States conclude, within 2010, the terms of the revised Treaty establishing the new public promoter, and the financial model for the implementation and operation of the project including the respective financial contribution
- the preliminary design study is approved by both Member States by the end of 2010
- excavation of the Maddalena Gallery starts, at the latest, by the first quarter of 2011
- the final design studies are completed by the end of 2011

### MAP Review

